

Christchurch Call Advisory Network

Terms of Reference

1. Name

The Christchurch Call Advisory Network (CCAN) consists of organizations and individuals from civil society, academia, and the technical community convened as part of the [Christchurch Call](#), which emerged as a response to the Christchurch massacre on March 15, 2019, when 51 Muslims were killed during prayer.

2. Mission Statement

The CCAN exists to provide expert advice on implementing the commitments in the Call in a manner consistent with a free, open, and secure internet and with international human rights law. CCAN balances a spectrum of civil society, internet governance, and human rights concerns, including the right to be free from deprivation of life and incitement to violence, as well as the right to free expression. CCAN accomplishes its work through meaningful collaboration with governments, civil society organizations, and private sector actors.

The CCAN will strive to achieve an appropriate balance of diverse and relevant perspectives and expertise across at least the following dimensions:

- i. Diversity of expertise, including but not limited to international human rights law, education, technology, content moderation, extremism and radicalization;
- ii. Geographic perspective - emphasis should be placed on including members who represent countries in the “Global South” ;
- iii. Affected communities - emphasis should be placed on including members from communities directly affected by violence and extremism, and those disproportionately affected by counter-terrorism efforts.

3. Membership

a. Original members

The CCAN was initially composed of approximately 40 organizations and individuals who responded to a request for expressions of interest posted by the New Zealand and French governments in 2019.

b. Eligibility Criteria for new members

- i. Membership is limited to civil society organizations (i.e. non-governmental and not for profit organizations) and individuals.
- ii. Members must demonstrate relevant background, expertise, and/or perspectives they will contribute (see Section 3.d below).
- iii. Members must demonstrate a basic commitment to human rights (such as the rights to be free from deprivation of life, privacy, freedom of expression, freedom of assembly, freedom of religion, and not facilitate human rights abuse).
- iv. Organizations or individuals that have facilitated human rights abuses including under cover of or otherwise in pursuit of counterterrorism objectives cannot be part of the Advisory Network without a clearly demonstrated commitment to human rights.
- v. Members must demonstrate that their work is consistent with an open, interoperable, and global Internet.
- vi. Members must be independent of governments and companies. To qualify for membership, they should, if applicable:
 1. Establish that they have organizational and accountability structures in place, such as being registered as a non-governmental organization in their country or providing visibility of their operations through a published statement of purpose and meeting minutes;
 2. Include in their application a statement that their work is not directed or strongly influenced by a government or private sector company.
 3. To the extent applicants receive significant funding (more than 25% of their operating budget) from governments or corporations, the application should disclose the total percentage of their operating revenue that comes from these sources, the specific governments or companies that provide funding, and what measures they take to ensure/maintain independence from those funders.
 4. Organizations need not disclose how much funding they receive from any particular source, and financial information will not be shared with anyone not directly involved in determining membership eligibility for the applicant; such disclosure could pose serious legal, reputational, or security risks to the applicant or its partners.

c. Admitting new members

- i. The CCAN may choose to publish a call for expression of interest in membership at any time. CCAN will also review members submitted by the French and New Zealand government.
- ii. In order to ensure a broad and diverse range of membership, members are allowed and encouraged to undertake individual outreach. The governments of New Zealand and France may also refer interested individuals and organizations for consideration.

d. Application process

- i. Expressions of interest in membership should be presented to the Core Committee of the CCAN in writing and should include an explanation of how the prospective member meets the criteria in Section 3 (b), as well as supporting links or attachments (e.g. website, social media, reports).
- ii. Every 3 months the Core Committee of CCAN will review any expressions of interest submitted during that period. This review shall be conducted in consultation with the representatives of France and New Zealand.
- iii. Any applicant with concerns or challenges regarding a written expression of interest (e.g. for security, safety, or accessibility reasons) may contact the Co-chairs, through the CCAN website's contact page. The co-chairs will make alternate arrangements.
- iv. The Core Committee of CCAN will decide whether the expression of interest should be
 - 1. welcomed,
 - 2. declined, or
 - 3. deferred until the next round of review.
- v. Prospective members will be informed of this decision, including reasons for rejection if applicable, in a timely manner.
- vi. The website listing CCAN membership will be updated with changes to its membership within 10 working days.

e. Conditions of Membership

- i. Members shall disclose any changes to their circumstances that affect or may be reasonably perceived to affect their eligibility under section 3(e) by writing to the Core Committee as soon as practicable and no later than 28 days from the date of the change.
- ii. Members shall maintain "active" status by
 - 1) attending at least one CCAN meeting per calendar year, or
 - 2) responding with the information requested in the annual check in emails or
 - 3) at least once a year, in response to the co-chairs' request, report on how their work aligns with CCAN's mission.
- iii. Members shall not act in ways that harm or prejudice the objectives contained in the CCAN mission statement.

f. Withdrawal of membership

Any member of the CCAN may withdraw unilaterally from the CCAN at any time by notifying the Core Committee co-chairs in writing. They will be removed from the public list of members and from CCAN communication channels within 15 business days.

g. Removal of members

- i. Any member of the CCAN or the Co-Chairs can submit a written request to the Core Committee to have another member of the CCAN removed for any of the following reasons:
 1. Bad faith conduct: bad faith prejudicial to the interests and objectives of the CCAN or the Christchurch Call
 2. Ineligibility for membership in accordance with Section 3(b), including due to material changes to the organization's eligibility
 3. For Core Committee members, as outlined in Section 3 (b)(iv), persistent failure to participate in CCAN discussions, meetings, calls, and other activities.
- ii. The member proposed for removal will have 15 business days to respond.
- iii. After 15 days, the request and any response will be presented to the Core Committee for a decision via modified consensus as outlined in Section 7(b)
- iv. After modified consensus is reached, the co-chairs will send the list to the NZ and FR governments
- v. The members that have been removed can decide (in coordination with the governments) to engage with the Call Community in other ways.
- vi. Inactive members: Inactive members can remain on the mailing list and receive the regular updates, but they will not be displayed as members of CCAN on CCAN website and public facing communications. If inactive members start providing input and meet the Conditions of membership (section 3.e), they can request to reactivate their membership and be displayed on the website as members of the general consultation network.
- vii. Members that have been removed based on bad faith conduct and ineligibility due to material changes will be removed from CCAN mailing list.

h. Representatives of organisations

- i. Organizational members should designate a primary point of contact, and may designate additional members of the organization to receive emails and participate in conversations. Any changes to such designations should be made in writing to the co-chairs.
- ii. If a person who has been representing an organization on CCAN wishes to become an individual member, they may submit a request to the co-chairs, who shall put it on the agenda for approval at a meeting of the Core Committee, subject to meeting the membership criteria and application requirements

- iii. If a person who has been representing an organization on CCAN wishes to represent a different organization, that organization must submit an application as outlined in Section 3.d.
- iv. In case of a membership change under sections 3.h(ii) or 3.h(iii), the organization previously represented may either designate a new representative or withdraw from CCAN pursuant to section 3(f).

4. Co-Chairs

a. Election and terms

- i. The CCAN Core Committee will elect up to three co-chairs.
- ii. At least one co-chair should represent a civil society organization from New Zealand.
- iii. A Co-Chair's term is one year.
- iv. Co-chairs may serve up to three consecutive one-year terms, including the initial term.
- v. Co-chairs lead both the Core Committee and the consultation network

b. Roles and responsibilities

Co-chairs will be responsible for:

- i. Scheduling and facilitating meetings.
- ii. Ensuring that regular communication continues with government and company representatives.
- iii. Ensuring that both the Core Committee and the Consultation Network represent a diversity of views and backgrounds.
- iv. Formulating a code of conduct, conflict of interest policy, more detailed information management policies, and dispute resolution procedures to be shared with the Core Committee for approval, and this ToR will be updated with a link to those documents when they have been prepared.
- v. reaching out to the members on an annual basis to undertake the check-in process. The members must reply to the co-chairs email within 15 days.
- vi. Liaise with any member organisation who has agreed to act as the fundholder, as under 9.ii.

5. Core Committee

a. Composition

- i. The CCAN is comprised of a Core Committee and a broader Consultation Network in order to facilitate both decision-making when necessary and a broad and diverse range of input.

- ii. The Core Committee of the CCAN shall have a maximum of 25 members.
- iii. CCAN members are not guaranteed a position on the Core Committee. As outlined in section 3b, Core Committee members agree to take on increased responsibility and increased input into decision-making.
- iv. Members are eligible to serve on the Core Committee for up to five years. After five years, they must spend at least one year off the core committee before applying for readmission.
- v. For organizations, membership in the Core Committee is tied to the organisation, not its representative. If a representative changes their organizational affiliation pursuant to section 3(h), their new organization is eligible for up to three consecutive one-year terms.
- vi. To maintain a diversity of voices and perspectives in the Core Committee, in cases where a person has spent more than three years on the Core Committee due to different organizational affiliations, the Co-Chairs may request that a member organization change its representative to the Core Committee or that an individual member step down from the Core Committee for at least one year.

b. Roles and Responsibilities

- i. A Core Committee will assume responsibility for coordinating the day-to-day work of the CCAN.
- ii. Core Committee members will engage in modified consensus decision-making to
 - 1. Add new members
 - 2. Approve statements and public communications in the name of the Network
 - 3. Sign on to statements in the name of the Network, including requests for feedback made by signatories of the Call
- iii. Core Committee members agree to
 - 1. Attend internal and external meetings
 - 2. Take part in modified consensus decision-making
- iv. To form the initial Core Committee, the co-chairs will request self-nominations from the entire CCAN membership. At least once a year, the co-chairs will ask Core Committee members to reaffirm their interest in continued membership, and reach out to the Consultation Network to solicit additional self-nominations, with a commitment to maintaining diversity in the Core Committee in accordance with section 5.a(v).
- v. Should Core Committee members fail to attend two consecutive CCAN internal meetings without notification or fail to respond to requests for participation in consensus decision making without notification for two consecutive decisions, they shall be removed from membership in the Core Committee, but they will still be considered part of the Consultation Network. Co-chairs will communicate removal from the Core Committee to affected members and to appropriate government representatives.
- vi. Organizational members should identify a specific person to participate in Core Committee meetings and decision-making, and should notify the co-chairs if they wish to designate a

different person for participation.

6. Consultation Network

i. The Consultation Network will be unlimited in size. Subject to meeting the membership criteria and requirements set out in this Terms of Reference, organisations and individuals can become part of the Consultation Network.

ii. The Consultation Network will have access to the Google Group to facilitate their feedback and contributions.

7. Working Methods of the CCAN

a. Meetings

i. Online meetings will be organized to accommodate the greatest range of timezones, but co-chairs will strive to provide secondary calls for time zones that are excluded.

ii. Co-chairs will ensure that someone is taking minutes and that those minutes are shared with the full consultation network.

iii. When possible, face-to-face meetings will be held alongside existing related events e.g. RightsCon, the Internet Governance Forum, or the Freedom Online Coalition, and arrangements will be made for remote participation.

iv. Internal CCAN meetings will include only CCAN members (not government or company representatives) and will take place on an as-needed basis, but at least 4 times annually.

v. Government points of contact will schedule online or in-person meetings to consult on specific topics and provide updates. Governmental points of contact will provide advance notice of meetings, remote participation options, and (for in-person meetings) financial/visa support whenever possible.

b. Decision-making

The CCAN strives to come to a modified consensus on decisions, and modified consensus is the default decision making process.

i. Decision making is done by the Core Committee. Whenever possible, the Consultation Network will have the opportunity to provide input into decisions, including adding new members.

ii. "Modified consensus" means that no more than 2 members of the group disagree with (block) a decision.

iii. Members can "stand aside" during a consensus decision-making process. This is the equivalent of abstaining. Members can ask that their "stand aside" be recorded.

iv. If more than one third ($\frac{1}{3}$) of members "stand aside" then consensus has not been reached and

at least $\frac{2}{3}$ of members must participate in order to reach consensus.

v. Occasionally “votes” are necessary. When the CCAN has to make decisions with an externally imposed deadline, such as picking representatives for a meeting, if the decision can not be made by consensus a super majority (2/3) vote is acceptable.

vi. Decision-making should happen during meetings whenever possible. vii. Meetings require $\frac{2}{3}$ of the current core committee.

viii. Whenever decision-making is made outside of a meeting, members will have at least 72 hours to respond, not including weekends and public holidays, in order to accommodate multiple time zones. If members do not respond, they will be counted as standing aside. Member organisations are responsible for advising the co-chairs of what dates their public holidays fall.

ix. Decision making processes will be recorded by one or more co-chair, and reflected in the minutes of the relevant meeting or in a follow-up email if they took place outside the context of a meeting.

x. Votes can be conducted “in person” at meetings or on conference calls, by email, or using secure web platforms designed for this purpose.

c. Internal Communications

The Network conducts the majority of its work online, through conference calls, shared documents, and Slack.

i. Members of the Network are on a Google mailing list (“listserv”) that includes members of the New Zealand and French governments. The mailing list will include Core Committee members and Consultation Network members.

ii. The CCAN should receive monthly updates from the governmental points of contact on the work of the Christchurch call, including related initiatives organized by others (e.g. GIFCT and its member companies, OECD, Incident Response Network).

iii. Governmental points of contact will report back to the network after relevant meetings (see section 9)

iv. Signatories of the Call will communicate opportunities for feedback and consultation in a timely manner as described in section 8(ii).

v. External Communications will be coordinated by the co-chairs. All members of the Core Committee will be provided with 72 hours excluding weekends and public holidays to comment on or “block” external communications.

8. Collaboration with convening governments

Aligned with CCAN’s mission, CCAN engages with Governmental points of contact on the basis that it will be provided meaningful opportunities for feedback and dialogue. Without limiting the ways that this dialogue can be fostered, CCAN urges governmental contacts to

- i. Share knowledge about progress and direction changes on work plans;
- ii. Send relevant documents to the listserv:
 - 1. Provide sufficient time for feedback - no less than one week; and
 - 2. Provide a response on how the feedback was applied, and reasons, if not.

iii. When feasible, the CCAN will provide feedback as a group, but members of the CCAN are welcome to provide individual feedback. When appropriate, members of CCAN are encouraged to share their individual feedback with the CCAN and invite other members to add their names in support.

9. Funding:

The CCAN's secretariat receives funding from the governments of New Zealand and France. We will ask corporate and government Christchurch Call signatories to support participation for smaller organisations and individuals who cannot afford to attend meetings. Funding allocation will be based on financial need, and priority will be given to organizations and individuals representing affected communities as outlined in Section 2.iii.

- i. CCAN may apply for funding to run its operations through a range of funders. Any such funding applications will be reviewed to ensure they do not compromise the independence of CCAN. Funding applications must be approved by the Core Committee using the decision-making process outlined in clause 4(b).
- ii. Funding received for the operations of CCAN will be held by a member organisation, as agreed by the Core Committee. Any organisation who holds such funds on behalf of CCAN will enter into a Memorandum of Understanding with CCAN regarding the disbursements of funds and agreed processes of approval.
- iii. The Core Committee will establish policies and procedures for how funds may be used for compensation and expense reimbursement to CCAN members and others as appropriate.

10. Relationship to other actors

(such as other Christchurch Call governments; Global Internet Forum to Counter Terrorism (GIFCT) and the GIFCT Independent Advisory Committee; Freedom Online Coalition and the FOC's Advisory Network).

The CCAN expects to be notified about discussions and collaboration in other fora, such as the reorganization of GIFCT, the OECD's efforts to create standardized transparency reporting on "terrorist and violent extremist content" takedowns, and the resolution on social media and violent extremist content online that was adopted at the 2019 International Conference of Data Protection and Privacy Commissioners conference.

11. Changes to these Terms of Reference

Co-chairs and active members can propose changes to this ToR. Proposed changes will

be brought to the Core Committee, with three weeks' notice for members to be able to form a view on the matter(s) being raised. The modified ToR will then be sent to the relevant representatives of the French and New Zealand governments for review and approval. Modified consensus will be used to make any changes to the Terms of Reference.

Last Updated 30 June 2022